June 23, 2015

John Mackey Co-CEO Whole Foods Market 550 Bowie Street Austin, TX 78703

Dear Mr. Mackey,

As Certified Organic farmers we value our longstanding relationships with Whole Foods Market. Very few businesses have done more to help build our organic movement over the last several decades. We sincerely value your patronage.

However, and we don't articulate this discontent lightly, we are deeply concerned that Whole Foods' newly launched "Responsibly Grown" rating program is onerous, expensive, and shifts the cost of this marketing initiative to growers, many of whom are family-scale farmers with narrow profit margins. We have limited amounts of management and staff time that are sorely taxed to execute the voluminous application your company has developed.

Paying for this program, its required technology, and the labor necessary to participate will be impossible for many of the smallest family-scale farmers and an excessive burden on medium-sized organic operations. We have surveyed numerous growers who have already complied and they estimate their costs ranging from \$5,000 to \$20,000.

Furthermore, our greatest concern is the devaluation of the organic label in Whole Foods Market stores. The "Responsibly Grown" program allows conventional farmers utilizing lower-cost management techniques, still incorporating toxic inputs, to unfairly compete with Certified Organic produce in your stores on a level footing with — or even rated better than — organic farmers. Growing ecologically produced food isn't cheap. And to that we must add the considerable cost of organic certification. Whole Foods has done so much to help educate its customers about the advantages of eating an organic diet. This new rating program undermines, to a great degree, those efforts.

Please take a look at the photographs below of asparagus sold by Whole Foods in California this spring. Why would your customer buy a "Good" asparagus, from a local, Certified Organic farm, when they could spend a lot less to buy the "Best" asparagus from a conventional farm in Mexico?

Mr. Mackey, you have long recognized that, both in the avoidance of toxic agrichemical residues in our food and in protecting our soil, air and water, farmers and farm workers, organic practices pay dividends to individual shoppers and society. The organic label is truly the gold standard.

We thoroughly understand the economic risks we are taking in articulating our concerns. Many growers we have spoken with share these concerns but feel too intimidated to come forward. Whole Foods is a dominant player in the organic marketplace and sales to your company are an important part of our farms' and families' incomes. But we have spent our life's work building the organic movement and we fear that this new marketing approach puts much of that progress at risk.

We respectfully submit a number of substantive recommendations for modification to your "Responsibly Grown" program. This could allow us to participate, as partners, and would help differentiate Whole Foods stores and the produce you sell without harming the Certified Organic growers the company has always championed:

- 1. No produce should ever be rated "Better" or "Best" in the program unless it is Certified Organic.
- 2. Under no circumstances should any Certified Organic produce be identified as "Unrated" in your stores. Certified Organic products <u>are</u> already "rated" and third-party inspected by accredited agents of the USDA. Unlike WFM's rating program, the USDA's National Organic Program carries the authority of federal law and does not exclusively depend on self-reporting.
- 3. Currently, the 10 points in the 300-point WFM scoring system that are awarded to a grower who maintains Certified Organic status is severely and unfairly suppressed.
- 4. National Organic Program (NOP) standards, like the WFM farmer questionnaire, focus to a great degree on cultural practices that enhance soil health and prevent environmental damage. Not only should your scoring system exempt Certified Organic producers from further documenting issues covered by NOP law, Certified Organic farmers, whose compliance is third-party verified, should be awarded extra points in every one of these areas.
- 5. When customers purchase Certified Organic produce in your stores, they protect and promote the health of their own families, and our planet, while that patronage assures us farmers, our workers, and our families are never exposed to toxic agrichemicals. This is a fundamental factor that a retailer of your ethical stature must hold paramount and could be an argument for not including <u>any</u> conventional produce in your "Responsibly Grown" rating system.
- 6. The monetary cost and time commitment to comply with the WFM rating program is excessive and will make it difficult or impossible for small, entry-level and many long-standing moderate-scale growers. As a corporation with one of the highest value market capitalizations in the grocery industry, it seems ethically irresponsible to shift the costs from your business enterprise, which stands to reap the benefit from this arrangement, to small business owners who are disproportionately powerless as individuals to negotiate with WFM.

All of us value our working relationships with Whole Foods. It was a difficult decision for each of us to come forward and share our concerns with you. Many other growers we have spoken with share our sentiments but have felt unable to put their livelihoods at risk. Your patronage is important to our farm enterprises.

However, being members of the organic movement, which many of us have been engaged in for well beyond 30 years, is a responsibility and a privilege we share with Whole Foods Market. Our life's work pays dividends to society and tangibly improves the stewardship of our planet. Unfortunately, we feel that WFM's "Responsibly Grown" program, in its current iteration, jeopardizes much of what we all have worked so hard to build.

We pray you will take our concerns seriously and we offer to collaborate with you on improving the "Responsibly Grown" rating program, while safeguarding Whole Foods Market's historical commitment to selling the very best produce in its stores.

Very truly yours,

Tom & Denesse Willey T&D Willey Farms Madera, California

Jim Crawford New Morning Farm Hustontown, Pennsylvania

Jeff Larkey Route 1 Farms Santa Cruz, California

Jim Cochran Swanton Berry Farm Davenport, California

Vernon Peterson Abundant Harvest Organics Kingsburg, California

Kevin Ryan Horsefeather Farm Lamoni, Iowa

Laura and Sally Harper Del Valle Pecans, LLC Mesilla Park, New Mexico Paul Underhill Terra Firma Farm Winters, California

Tim Mueller Riverdog Farm Guinda, California

Mark Stanley Help From Above Farms Three Springs, Pennsylvania

Dale and Christine Coke Jardines San Juan Bautista, California

Byron and Janice Smith Sunizona Family Farms Willcox, Arizona

Pete Johnson Pete's Greens Craftsbury, Vermont

Michael Collins Old Athens Farm Westminster, Vermont

Paul Harlow Harlow Farm Westminster, Vermont

David Marchant River Berry Farm Fairfax, Vermont

Annie Lévesque & Frédéric Jobin-Lawler L'Abri végétal Compton, Québec, Canada

This internationally known advocate for land ethics and sustainable agriculture supports his colleagues above:

Fred Kirschenmann Kirschenmann Family Farms Inc. Medina, North Dakota Distinguished Fellow, Leopold Center for Sustainable Agriculture The following Certified Organic farmers support their above-listed colleagues who are currently selling to Whole Foods. A number of the farmers below have previously sold to Whole Foods and some hope to in the future:

David Obermiller

Harvest Fields Organic Farm

Fresno, California

Jim & Megan Gerritsen Wood Prairie Farm Bridgewater, Maine

Grant Brians

Heirloom Organic Gardens

Hollister, California

Richard Bass Turtle Ledge Farm Hampton, Connecticut

Birgit and Erik Landowne

Kimberton CSA

Kimberton, Pennsylvania

Gail Schwenke Schwenke Farm Massena, Iowa

Cynthia A. Daley, Ph.D.

Organic Dairy Education & Research

Program

Professor/College of Agriculture

California State University

Chico, California

Andrew Dykstra Dykstra Farms

Burlington, Washington

Kirsten Olson & John Tannaci

Hunter Orchards Grenada, California

Dean McIlvaine

Twin Parks Organic Farm

West Salem, Ohio

Antoinette Foerster and Elaine Hierholzer

Foerster Organic Farm

Chicago, Illinois

Antonio Manzanares Shepard's Lamb

Tierra Amarilla, New Mexico

Fred Griffen

High Lonesome Farm Cincinnatus. New York

Alan Ward Ward Farm

Viborg, South Dakota

Mark Wickenhauser

Wicmar Dairy

Cologne, Minnesota

Catherine Wainer Sausalito Springs Petaluma, California

Rodney Graham Oxbow Organic Farm

Hunt, New York

Carla Kostka

Castle Rock Organic Farms

Osseo, Wisconsin

Tom Hunter

Tangled Bank Farm Wabasha, Minnesota

Richard Parrott

Parrott's Organic Farm & Livestock

Twin Falls, Idaho

Lou Johns

Blue Heron Farm Lodi, New York Nancy Coonridge

Coonridge Organic Goat Cheese

Pie Town, New Mexico

John R. Myer Myer Farm

Ovid, New York

Ron Ackerman

Ackerman Certified Organic Farm

Chenoa, Illinois

David Van Eeckhout Hog's Back Farm, LLC Arkansaw, Wisconsin

Bill Jessup B&J Ranch

Thermal, California

Kathie Arnold

Twin Oaks Dairy LLC Truxton, New York

Tim P. Miller Millberg Farms Kyle, Texas

Kate Burroughs

Aloha 'Aina Tropicals Laupohoehoe, Hawaii

John Boere J & D Dairy

Modesto, California

Barrie and Vaughan Grant

Grant Grove

Bonsall, California

Jim Eldon

Fiddler's Green Farm Brooks, California

Ion Bansen

Double J Jerseys, Inc. Monmouth, Oregon

Les and Debbie Guile Walnut Grove Farm Augusta, New Jersey

Helmut Klauer Classic Organics Gaviota, California

Douglas Bowne Wellspring Farm Little Falls, New York

Sen. David Zuckerman, VT State Senate

Full Moon Farm Hinesburg, Vermont

Tom Szulist

Singer Farm Naturals, LLC

Appleton, New York

The following organizations have also signed on in support of organic farmers:

Ecological Farming Association (EFA)

California Certified Organic Farmers

(CCOF)

(CCOF)

Food and Water Watch

Northeast Organic Dairy Producers

Alliance (NODPA)

Maine Organic Farmers and Gardeners

Association (MOFGA)

Center for Food Safety

Rural Advancement Foundation

International (RAFI-USA)

The Cornucopia Institute

Food Democracy Now

Community Alliance with Family Farmers (CAFF)

Western Organic Dairy Producers Alliance (WODPA)

Cornentional
Asparagus
Fresh, earthy and pleasantly gras are crisp and slightly starchy with cooking, richer tasting with longal cooking Boiling and steaming are classic cooking methods our grain roasting ingulgiths natural swee.

SSLI-98

Altow's Richer

Altow's Richer

The Organic Seed Growers and Trade Association

Organic Consumers Association

Photographs of asparagus sold by Whole Foods in California this spring.
Conventionally grown asparagus from Mexico is rated "Best" while more expensive asparagus, from a local, Certified Organic farm in California, is rated only "Good". Which will most customers likely choose?

